

The Realization of Experiential Meaning in Indonesian Subtitles of *The Kingdom* (2007): Cases of Transitivity System Clausal Constituents Reduction

Romel Noverino^{1*}, Mangatur Rudolf Nababan², Riyadi Santosa² and Djatmika²

¹*Doctoral Program of Linguistics, Sebelas Maret University, Surakarta, 57126, Indonesia*

²*English Department, Faculty of Cultural Science, Sebelas Maret University, Surakarta, 57126, Indonesia*

ABSTRACT

In Systemic Functional Linguistics, experience is part of the ideational function, consisting of clausal constituents of process, participant, and circumstance. This article discusses the results of a qualitative study, within the framework analysis of Halliday's transitivity system, on how clausal constituent reductions in subtitles have contributed to experiential meaning realizations systemically and functionally. Objective data were collected through purposive sampling from *The Kingdom* (2007) and its official Indonesian subtitles. The results show that, systemically, reduction happened in seven combinations, namely reduction of participant; process; circumstance; participant and process; participant and circumstance; process and circumstance; and participant, process, and circumstance. The reduction of process resulted in the absence of experiential meaning in the subtitles, which dominantly related to material, relational, and mental processes. The reduction of participant contributed to the nonappearance of one or all of the entities in the process, such as actor and/or goal in material process; senser in mental process; and token in identifying relational process. The reduction of circumstance resulted in the nonattendance of circumstantial information

in the process, which dominantly related to location. Functionally, some data show that reduction was imposed obligatorily to accommodate the socio-cultural context of acceptability in Indonesia through film censorship with a religious motivation.

Keywords: Clausal constituents, experiential meaning, subtitles reduction, systemic functional linguistics, transitivity system

ARTICLE INFO

Article history:

Received: 25 October 2019

Accepted: 13 March 2020

Published: 26 June 2020

E-mail addresses:

romel@student.uns.ac.id (Romel Noverino)

amantaradja@yahoo.com (Mangatur Rudolf Nababan)

riyadisantosa@staff.uns.ac.id (Riyadi Santosa)

djatkika@staff.uns.ac.id (Djatkika)

* Corresponding author

INTRODUCTION

Systemic Functional Linguistics (SFL) emphasizes two main aspects of language: system and function. The term ‘systemic’ relates to language as a discourse, consisting of systems that operate hierarchically and simultaneously from the lower system (phonology/graphology) to the higher system (lexicogrammar, text structure, and semantic discourse) (Halliday as cited in Santosa, 2010). The term ‘functional’ engages language as a text in its inherent relation to context (Manfredi, 2008). A text is always constructed in two contexts, cultural and situational. The cultural context refers to values and norms that shape social processes in society and consequently, culture influences the way language is used (Martin, Liddicoat as cited in Santosa, 2009). Meanwhile, in SFL, situational context refers to variables of field (domain of experience/subject matter of a text), tenor (roles and relationships of those involved in a text) and mode (rhetorical mode, medium, and channel of a text). These variables outline “a multi-dimensional semiotic space – the environment of meanings in which language, other semiotic systems, and social systems operate” (Halliday & Matthiessen, 2014).

As domain of experience, field refers to the ideational function and here, the experience is realized through the system of transitivity. Halliday (1967) stated that “the transitivity systems are concerned with the type of process expressed in the clause, with the participants in this process, animate and inanimate, and with

various attributes and circumstances of the process and the participants”. By referring to this statement, it is through a clause that experience is transformed into meaning by its main constituent, i.e. process. However, as a whole, constituents of participant and circumstance also have functions, namely as entities involved in the process and as circumstantial information in the process (Eggins, 2004; Halliday & Matthiessen, 2006, 2014).

One of the areas of studies closely related to meaning is translation. In translating a text, the pivotal point is on producing equivalence, namely equality of meaning. Halliday (2001) stated that “equivalence is the aspect taken into account in assessing whether a translation is good or bad”. Since the basic concept of translating a text is to transfer an event (experience) from the source text (ST) with its embedded socio-cultural context into that of the target text (TT) (Santosa, 2009), the equivalence is mostly placed on the ideational function. Halliday (2001) stated that “translation equivalence is defined in ideational terms; if a text does not match its source text ideationally, it does not qualify as a translation”. Therefore, through transitivity system analysis, the ideational meaning of ST and TT can be compared to determine whether or not the two texts embody the same experiential meaning realization.

As part of Audiovisual Translation, subtitles are translation products that have distinctive characteristics compared to other written translations. Spatially, there should only be two lines of subtitles appearing at the bottom of a screen and each line consists

of up to 40-45 characters. Temporally, the appearance of subtitles is within 3-7 seconds, depending on synchronization (Diaz-Cintas & Remael, 2007; de Linde & Kay, 1999; Dries, 1995; Gottlieb, 1998; Zhang & Liu, 2009). Synchronization means the appearance of subtitles is in line with the verbal utterances of the film (Diaz-Cintas & Remael, 2007).

Due to the above-mentioned technical rules of space and time and synchronization, subtitles tend to undergo reduction. Diaz-Cintas and Remael (as cited in Noverino et al., 2019) stated that subtitles could never maintain a complete and detailed meaning of film verbal text due to reduction but there are reasons for applying it: 1) Viewers/listeners can absorb verbal text faster than written text so the subtitles must give them enough time to be understood; 2) In addition to reading subtitles, viewers also see the action on the screen and listen to non-voiced sounds so they must have sufficient time to combine reading the subtitles and seeing the action; 3) Subtitles are limited to only a maximum of two lines per caption.

Studies of subtitles and SFL have been conducted by Espindola (2010), Feitosa (2009), Kovačič (1998), Matielo (2011), Matielo et al. (2015), Noverino et al. (2019), and Taylor (2000). These empirical studies all serve as exemplars of SFL being fruitful in analysing meaning between ST in film and its subtitles from ideational, interpersonal and textual metafunction perspectives.

As far as the authors are aware, there has been little work dedicated specifically to the study of experiential meaning realization

in subtitles featuring reduction. Matielo et al.'s study (2015) investigated experiential meaning in Brazilian Portuguese subtitles in relation to reduction but their finding was only based on the systemic analysis. Another study was conducted by Noverino et al. (2019) who systemically and functionally investigated the reduction of English nominal group experiential structures in Indonesian subtitles. However, their study examined how the reduction affected the realization of the entity and not on the realization of experiential meaning.

As an illustration, understanding the meaning of a clause can be done by breaking the clause into process, participant and circumstance, which is the concrete expression of ideational meaning. A text is analyzed in the transitivity system with the following formula: "Who (or what) did what to whom (or what) where, when, how and why" (Halliday & Matthiessen, 2014). "Who and what" represents participant; "did what" represents process; and "where, when, how and why" represents circumstance.

In the semantic and functional perspectives of ideational meaning, the way events are realized in a linguistic structure reflects the reality of experiential meaning that exists in the world. Although the lexicogrammatical structure between languages is different, meaning can be transferred from one language to another through functional 'pieces'. Transferring the same linguistic units from ST to TT is difficult because of the potential for shifts but the main thing in SFL perception is to produce meaning with the same

function. So, it can be said that studying the experiential meaning within the transitivity system in the text is done by identifying the functional role of the constituents in the clause. Therefore, when one or more clausal constituents are reduced in the TT, the functional role of the constituents in realizing experiential meaning will be lost and this causes the meaning to be different from the one in the ST.

This present study is an attempt to investigate experiential meaning realization in Indonesian subtitles of *The Kingdom* (2007) as the impact of the clausal constituent reduction. The experiential meaning realization is analysed not only systemically (within the transitivity system) but also functionally (within the situational and cultural context of acceptability in Indonesia).

LITERATURE REVIEW

Transitivity System

Experience is construed through transitivity system as “...the whole grammatical resources for construing goings-on” (Martin et al., 1997). In functional grammar, it refers to the system for describing all clausal constituents (Thompson, 2014).

In a clause, the experiential meaning is fundamentally represented in the process, realized in a verbal group. Each process has a number of participants, realised in a nominal group, and circumstance, realised in an adverbial group or a prepositional phrase (Halliday & Matthiessen, 2014). Table 1 below shows the realizations of clausal constituents

Table 1
Clausal constituents and their realizations

Clausal constituents	Typically realized by
Process	Verbal Group
Participant	Nominal Group
Circumstance	Adverbial Group or Prepositional Phrase

The transitivity system conceptualizes a clause as being of a particular process type. There are six types of processes, namely material, mental, relational, behavioural, verbal, and existential. Each type has a different set of participants (Halliday & Matthiessen, 2014) (see Table 2).

The material process relates to the physical action of doing and happening. Its main participants are actor (doer of the action) and goal (target of the action). Additionally, the other participants are beneficiary (recipient of the action) and scope (range of the action) (Fontaine, 2013; Halliday & Matthiessen, 2014).

The mental process relates to sensory power. Its participants are senser, the participant who feels/senses event cognitively, perceptively or emotionally, and phenomenon, the participant that becomes the perceived object (Fontaine, 2013; Halliday & Matthiessen, 2014).

The relational process connects participants in an abstract relationship. In English, this type of process, generally, involves linking verbs or verbs that indicate possession. The relational process is divided into attributive and identifying. Attributive relates to the process of connecting carrier, the participant that a particular quality is attributed to, with attribute, the participant

expressing the particular quality of the carrier. Meanwhile, identifying relates to the process of connecting token, the participant for which identification is intended, with value, the participant expressing the identification of the token (Fontaine, 2013; Halliday & Matthiessen, 2014).

The behavioural process is a type of process between material and mental processes. This type of process involves physical and psychological process. There is only one participant in behavioural process, behavior (Fontaine, 2013; Halliday & Matthiessen, 2014).

The verbal process relates to a verbal statement. Its participants consist of sayer, the participant expressing the verbal statement; verbiage, the content of the verbal statement; and receiver, the recipient of the verbal statement (Fontaine, 2013; Halliday & Matthiessen, 2014).

The existential process indicates the existence of its participant. In English, this process uses a special clause structure, namely 'there' as the subject and then followed by a verb (such as *be*). The existing entity as indicated by the subject *there* is the participant, called existent (Fontaine, 2013; Halliday & Matthiessen, 2014).

Another constituent in a clause that also contributes to experiential meaning although its existence tends to be optional is circumstance. Circumstance is the name for elements in a clause having semantic content concerning the condition of processes and participants (Bloor & Bloor, 2014). Halliday and Matthiessen (2014) divided circumstance into nine elements, namely extent, location, manner, cause, contingency, accompaniment, role, matter and guise.

Audiovisual Translation and the Idiosyncrasies of Reduction in Subtitles

The term audiovisual translation has been applied since the 1990s to the practice of translation which covers visual semiotic channels and has become an academic term that is commonly used by translation scholars (Diaz-Cintas & Remael, 2007). Three activities in the audiovisual translation are subtitling, dubbing, and voice-over.

When examining issues related to subtitling, it is important to understand how the function of this form of translation and why this must be seen differently from other types of translation? Subtitling is a process of translating film verbal text into written text (Diaz-Cintas & Remael, 2007).

Table 2
Types of Process and their interrelated types of participant

Processes		Participants
Material		Actor; Goal; Beneficiary; Scope
Mental		Senser; Phenomenon
Relational	(Attributive)	Carrier; Attribute
	(Identifying)	Token; Value
Behavioural		Behaver
Verbal		Sayer; Verbiage; Receiver
Existential		Existent

The written text at the bottom part of the screen is called subtitles. It is within translation between languages (interlingual translation) that subtitles are considered to be the most effective because film audiences who do not understand the verbal language of the film access the flow of information through subtitles.

Hatim and Mason (1997) stated four main obstacles in subtitling: 1. Shift mode from verbal to written. This may cause certain speech characteristics, e.g. non-standard dialects, intonation over codes, and turn-taking not represented in the subtitles; 2. Engagement with the media or channel for transferring the meaning of the verbal text includes the limitation of time and place related to the number of lines and characters; 3. Reduction of ST. This is somehow inherent in subtitling; 4. Conformity with visual images. Because visual and audio are inseparable from the film, the coherence between subtitles and moving images must be appropriate.

All these obstacles inevitably lead to reduction in subtitles. There are two types of reduction in subtitles: partial and total. Partial reduction is achieved through condensation and the total reduction is achieved through the elimination or removal of lexical elements. (Diaz-Cintas & Remael, 2007).

Since films and TV programs are produced, sold, re-edited, translated, reproduced, re-translated, and distributed in different formats, for different media, and by different people, the notions of 'original text' and 'original authors' seem to have evaporated. In other words, ST is still

translated into TT but because translating is an activity within the scope of linguistic and culture, the original text in the film that contains the message as intended by the author has the potential to experience changes in meaning which are different from the author's intentions by way of reduction due to adjustments to the culture of the target language.

Buden et al. (2009) stated that etymologically, translation was able to connect various humans who were bound by their respective cultures with different languages and showed mutual existence in general. In addition, Xie (2014) argued that because of the problems of environmental crisis, uneven development, injustice, and human rights issues, the world needed to start anew and redefine modernity. The first step to do this is through translation as a way to change the concept of universality into political space and (re)negotiations between local and global, hegemony and marginal, and the West and the rest, so that it can reflect or represent different ways of human, political heritage and cultural traditions in shared global concepts related to development, democracy, and happiness. Placing translation as a way to construct universality with the aim of having a positive impact on humans means that the translator's ability to convey meaning and messages for his readers is an absolute requirement.

METHODS

This product-oriented translation study used qualitative research method with a case study

design in assessing experiential meaning realization in the Indonesian subtitles of *The Kingdom* (2007) as the impact of clausal constituent reduction. The experiential meaning realization was analyzed under Halliday's transitivity system framework. The sources of data are English-language film entitled *The Kingdom* (2007) and its official Indonesian subtitles. This film and its Indonesian subtitles passed censorship by the Indonesian Film Censorship Board on December 19, 2007, with an identification number of 6092/VCD/R/PA/2.2008/2007 under the distribution of Vision Home Entertainment (Vision Interprima Pictures).

The collected data, by way of purposive sampling, are English clauses having reduction in their constituent(s) in the subtitles. Content analysis (Spradley as cited in Santosa, 2017) was used to crosscheck the subtitles with their original text transcriptions in identifying the reduction on clausal constituents.

The data were analysed inductively through three stages of analysis, namely domain, taxonomy, and componential (Spradley, as cited in Santosa, 2017). The focus of domain analysis is to make sure that the data are clauses of which constituent(s) is/are reduced in the subtitles. Afterwards, the data were analysed taxonomically by classifying them into types of reduced constituent(s), which are reduction of participant; process; circumstance; and combinations between the three.

The next stage is componential analysis. Since one of the underlying concepts of componential analysis is to highlight

differences for analysis, used to answer the structural problems of a study, the emphasis is on highlighting the differences of clausal constituent structure between ST and TT and explaining the experiential meaning realization on each respective text.

The film tells the story of an FBI team, Ronald Fleury (Jamie Foxx), Grant Sykes (Chris Cooper), Janet Mayes (Jennifer Garner), and Adam Leavitt (Jason Bateman) in investigating a bomb attack in the Ar-Rahmah settlement, home to American workers in Saudi Arabia, with the help of Colonel Al-Ghazi, commander of Saudi Arabia Police Force. This film requires maturity of thinking and logic for its audiences, especially in the portrayal of Muslims as terrorists. Hence, it is interesting to examine how information in the English clausal constituents with such portrayal is translated into Indonesian because the population of Indonesia is predominantly Muslim.

RESULTS

There were 483 English clausal instances of data whose constituents were reduced in the Indonesian subtitles in seven combinations. The combinations and frequencies of the reduction can be seen in Table 3. In detail, the types of each reduced constituent are displayed in Table 4.

When the process is reduced, it leads to the absence of experiential meaning realization in the subtitles. As seen in Table 4 that reduction of process, dominantly, happened to the material process. It means that the experiential meaning of doing or

Table 3
Combinations and frequencies of reduction of clausal constituent(s)

Combinations of Reduction of Constituents	Σ	Reduction of Participants	Reduction of Processes	Reduction of Circumstances
Participant	120	120	-	-
Process	40	-	40	-
Circumstance	51	-	-	51
Participant and Process	194	194	194	-
Participant and Circumstance	7	7	-	7
Process and Circumstance	18	-	18	18
Participant, Process and Circumstance	53	53	53	53
Total Clausal Data	483	-	-	-
Total Reductions of Constituents	-	374	305	129
			808	

Table 4
Reduction of constituents and their types

Reduction of Constituents and Their Types		Σ
Process	Material	153
	Mental	50
	Relational	85
	Verbal	10
	Existential	6
	Behavioral	1
Participant	Actor	87
	Goal	55
	Beneficiary	6
	Senser	70
	Phenomenon	19
	Carrier	17
	Token	66
	Values	22
	Sayer	11
	Verbiage	8
	Receiver	8
	Existent	5
	Circumstance	Location
Matter		9
Manner		11
Extent		7
Contingency		3
Cause		5
Accompaniment		6
Angle		2
	808	

happening from *The Kingdom* (2007) as an action film was not realized in the subtitles. Although the physical activities could still be viewed from the motion pictures, the flow of information which led one action to another was not represented in the subtitles. The participants in the material process were also those which were mostly reduced in the subtitles, namely actor and goal (see Table 4). It means that the experiential meaning concerning the doer of the action and target of the action was also not realized in the subtitles.

The second type of process which is reduced significantly is relational. It means that the experiential meaning in connecting one entity to another as a way to represent characters and to build a series of events is not realized in the subtitles. The identifying relational process and its participant, token, are those which are mostly reduced in this type of process. This leads to the absence of relating events and characters to certain identification in the subtitles.

Another type of process which is reduced considerably is the mental process.

Its participant, sener, is also reduced quite immensely. It means that the experiential meaning concerning entity that senses events of cognition, perception, and emotion is not realized in the subtitles.

Meanwhile, the type of circumstance which is mostly reduced is location. The reduction of location is mostly associated with the material process because such a process commonly relates to place and time of action. In detail, there were 64 spatial reductions and 22 temporal reductions which led to the absence of information about the attendances of places and time in the processes.

Reduction of Participant

The reduction of this constituent has removed the existence of one of the entities involved in the process (see Table 5).

In Table 5, the nominal group, *Suweidi*, as the participant of goal was reduced in the subtitles. In the ST, this clause represented an utterance of Agent Sykes, responding to Colonel Al-Ghazi’s statement that seemingly declined the FBI agents’ request to investigate a building outside the housing compound due to security reasons.

Suweidi (As-Suweidi or Al-Suweidi) is a settlement in the city of Riyadh, Saudi Arabia which was portrayed in the film as a militant stronghold in which Al Qaeda could recruit for their acts of terrorism. Also in the ST, *Suweidi* was equated with North Korea, which might indicate that from the American perspective, these two entities were considered as hostile areas.

The experiential meaning realization in the ST was that they had the military force to eliminate threats coming from the two entities. Meanwhile, the experiential meaning realization in the TT was that they had such force to be imposed on North Korea only. Since Islam is the state religion of Saudi Arabia and its law requires all citizens to be Muslims (U. S. Department of State, 2004), the ST seems to portray the inhabitants of *Suweidi* as Muslims associated with terrorism. It is postulated that *Suweidi* was reduced in the subtitles because this entity was not considered to be a hostile area as it was inhabited by Muslims and Indonesia as well as Saudi Arabia have emotional attachment to the idea that Muslims should not be equated with terrorism. North Korea, on the other hand, is a country having no emotional

Table 5
Example of reduction of participant

ST	We	Got	enough security	to invade	North Korea and Suweidi	
Constituent	Participant	Process	Participant	Process	Participant	
TT	Pasukan keamanan kita		cukup	menggempur	Korea Utara	
Constituent	Participant			Process	Participant	
BT	Our security forces		are	enough	to invade	North Korea
Constituent	Participant		Process	Process	Participant	

BT: Back Translation

attachment to Indonesians. Furthermore, it is a communist country, and communism is perceived as a latent threat in Indonesia. So, by clearly stating the equivalence of North Korea in the subtitles, it does not evoke any sentiments among Indonesians.

Therefore, the reduction of *Suweidi* as an entity associated with terrorism is functionally obligatory because it contradicts the socio-cultural context of acceptability in perceiving Muslims. This reduction is an act of censorship as regulated in the Indonesian Government Regulation Number 18 of 2014 concerning Guidelines and Criteria for Film Censorship, chapter III, article 29, section 2, and article 30, section 6 pertaining to censorship motivated by religious considerations. It is possible that if *Suweidi* were not censored, it may potentially evoke a sense among Indonesians that *Suweidi* is indeed a place associated with terrorism and this could elicit the impression that Muslims allow terrorism to flourish among them. Even worse, this may elicit an impression that Islam is associated with terrorism.

An interesting fact regarding *Suweidi* can be seen from how different it is informed in the English and Indonesian version websites of Wikipedia. The English version

website, [https://en.wikipedia.org/wiki/As-Suwaidi_\(Riyadh\)](https://en.wikipedia.org/wiki/As-Suwaidi_(Riyadh)), not only informs readers of its geographical and demographic conditions but also clearly states that *Suweidi* is associated with terrorism. On the other hand, its Indonesian version, [https://id.wikipedia.org/wiki/As-Suwaidi_\(Riyadh\)](https://id.wikipedia.org/wiki/As-Suwaidi_(Riyadh)), simply states its geographical information. Even though Wikipedia can be edited by anyone but at the very least, when the author accessed the two sites on August 26, 2019, there had been no edits in the Indonesian version to state that it is associated with terrorism.

Reduction of Process

The reduction of this constituent has removed the essence of experiential meaning in the clause (see Table 6).

In Table 6, four sequences of process, represented by the verbal group *breathe*, were reduced in the subtitles into only one. In the ST, this clause represented an utterance of Agent Fleury when trying to help Colonel Al-Ghazi who got shot during a raid at a house which turned out to be the house of Abu Hamza, the main perpetrator of terrorism in the film.

The repetitive instructions in the ST clearly construed experiential meaning

Table 6
Example of reduction of process

ST	Breathe,	<i>breathe,</i>	<i>breathe,</i>	<i>fucking breathe!</i>
Constituent	Process	Process	Process	Process
TT	Tarik nafas			
Constituent	Process			
BT	Breathe			
Constituent	Process			

which indicated a sense of emergency, urging Al-Ghazi to continue breathing until further medical assistance got there and helped him. However, the Indonesian subtitles did not construe the same experiential meaning as in the ST, i.e. it did not implicate any senses of emergency because it was not repetitive as in the ST.

Reduction of Circumstance

Reduction of this type removed the circumstantial information in the process (see Table 7).

In the subtitles, reduction happened in the constituent of circumstance, (*to*) *mosques*. In the ST, this clause represented an utterance regarding Osama Bin Laden’s reaction when The Kingdom of Saudi Arabia rejected his offer to expel Iraq from Kuwait and preferred US military assistance. The reduced circumstantial information was related to the location element of the place. The subtitles construed different experiential meaning realization from its ST, namely the process only took place at streets but not at mosques.

In the ST, since mosques were depicted as places that were used by Osama bin Laden to provoke hatred against The Kingdom of Saudi Arabia and America and this serves as justification for any acts of terrorism against the two countries, naturally, the circumstance was reduced in the Indonesian subtitles because within the socio-cultural context of Indonesia, mosques are perceived as sanctified places and are not construed as settings to disseminate the idea of terror as elicited in the ST. This reduction is functionally obligatory as it aims to protect the people of Indonesia, who are predominantly the followers of Islam, from the sentiment that a Mosque is a place to spread hostility. This kind of reduction is a manifestation of censorship related to religion (Scandura, 2004).

Guidelines and criteria for film censorship as regulated in *Peraturan Pemerintah No. 18 2014 tentang Lembaga Sensor Film* (Indonesian Government Regulation Number 18, 2014 on Film Censorship Board), chapter III, article 29, section 2 clearly states that one of the aspects for a film to be censored is

Table 7
Example of reduction of circumstance

ST	Osama	took	to the streets and <i>mosques</i>	to denounce	the U.S., the Royal Family and their unholy alliance.
Constituent	Participant	Process	Circumstance	Process	Participant
TT	Osama	turun	ke jalan-jalan	untuk mengecam	hubungan AS dengan keluarga kerajaan sebagai hubungan najis
Constituent	Participant	Process	Circumstance	Process	Participant
BT	Osama	took	to the streets	to denounce	the U.S., the Royal Family and their unholy alliance.
Constituent	Participant	Process	Circumstance	Process	Participant

related to religion. This aspect is further explained in article 30, section 6 which states that material related to religion that is subject to censorship includes visual scenes, dialogues, and/or monologues that can cause religious disharmony – those which taunt and/or underestimate the sanctity of religion or religious symbols.

Reduction of Participant and Process

In the data, the reduction of these two types of constituents predominantly removes the verbal group as a material process and the nominal group as participant of actor (see Table 8).

In Table 8, the nominal group *I* as participant of actor and the verbal group *spent* as material process are reduced in the subtitles. In the ST, this clause represents an utterance of Colonel Al-Ghazi responding to a question asked by Agent Fleury of whether or not he has been in the US.

In the ST, the experiential meaning realization is about an activity carried out in the past by the actor over a certain period of time at a particular place. Meanwhile, in the subtitles, the experiential meaning realization cannot be construed similarly as in the ST because the doer and the action are reduced.

Since one of the reduced constituents is the process, principally, the subtitles do not construe any experiential meaning. However, experiential meaning as realized in the ST can still be generated cohesively by referring to the preceding utterance, namely the question asked by Agent Fleury.

Reduction of Participant and Circumstance

The reduction of these two types of constituents removes information concerning one of the entities involved in the process and circumstantial information associated with the process (see Table 9).

In Table 9, the nominal group *us* as a participant of the receiver and the prepositional phrase *about that day* as a circumstance of matter are reduced in the subtitles. In the ST, this clause represents an utterance of Mr. Fleury’s son’s teacher asking Mr. Fleury to tell her and his son’s classmates about the childbirth process of his son. The teacher seems intrigued to ask as previously Kevin, Mr. Fleury’s son, says that when he was born, this was the happiest day of Mr. Fleury’s life.

Experiential meaning realization in the ST projects a verbal event that involves participants of sayer (you and Mr. Fleury)

Table 8
Example of reduction of participant and process

ST	<i>I</i>	<i>Spent</i>	4 days	in Quantico
Constituent	Participant	Process	Participant	Circumstance
TT			4 hari	di Quantico
Constituent			Participant	Circumstance
BT			4 days	in Quantico
Constituent			Participant	Circumstance

Table 9
Example of reduction of participant and circumstance

ST	Can	you	tell	<i>us</i>	<i>about that day,</i>	Mr. Fleury?
Constituent	Process	Participant	Process	Participant	Circumstance	Participant
TT	Bisa	Anda	ceritakan,			Tn. Fleury?
Constituent	Process	Participant	Process			Participant
BT	Can	you	tell,			Mr. Fleury?
Constituent	Process	Participant	Process			Participant

and receiver (*us*) concerning a particular matter (*about that day*). However, in the subtitles, the experiential meaning realization merely projects a verbal event which involves the participant of sayer. However, the same experiential meaning realization as projected in the ST can still be generated cohesively by referring to the previous reference as contextually described in the previous paragraph.

Reduction of Process and Circumstance

The reduction of these two types of constituents removes information concerning the event and the situation associated with the event (see Table 10).

In Table 10, the verbal group *come* and the adverbial group *here* are reduced in the subtitles. The ST is a compound sentence consisting of two clauses and

both are imperative. It is in the first clause that reduction of the process and the circumstance takes place. In the ST, this clause represents an utterance of Agent Leavitt asking Agent Fleury to advance toward him because he wants to show him a footage. In the first clause, the verbal group *come* indicates a material process, asking someone to move. Meanwhile, the adverbial group *here* indicates that the movement is associated with a spatial distance.

By examining the ST, it can be acknowledged that the experiential meaning realization is related to two kinds of processes, namely material which is associated with spatial circumstance and mental which involves a phenomenon. Meanwhile, the subtitles reduce the first clause totally, resulting in experiential meaning realization which only depicts the mental process having the same entity as in

Table 10
Example of reduction of process and circumstance

ST	<i>Come</i>	<i>here</i>	and	look at	this
Constituent	Process	Circumstance		Process	Participant
TT				Lihat	ini
Constituent				Pocess	Participant
BT				Look at	this
Constituent				Process	Participant

the ST. However, although the experiential meaning of the first clause is not realized in the subtitles, it is implicitly accommodated by the equivalence of the second clause because normatively, when a person asks someone whose position is at a certain distance to see something near to the person, s/he will make a physical movement of approaching the person.

Reduction of Participant, Process and Circumstance

Typically, this type of reduction does indicate a total reduction of a clause, namely it leads to the absence of holistic experiential meaning realization in the subtitles. However, in some data, although reduction happens on the three types of constituents but there is one constituent left in the subtitles, which is participant. This happens when the clause has more than one participant (see Table 11).

In Table 11, the nominal group *we* as the participant of token, the verbal group *got* as relational process and the adverbial group *down here* as circumstance of location are reduced in the subtitles. There is one participant which is not reduced in the subtitles, namely “a lot of bodies”.

In the ST, this clause represents an utterance of Agent Fran when he calls Agent Fleury, informing that there is a bomb attack at the American housing compound in Riyadh, Saudi Arabia, and the attack has caused many casualties. Agent Fran calls Agent Fleury from the crime scene. Therefore, the intended experiential meaning realization in the ST is informing that FBI Agents, stationed in Riyadh, are now at the bomb attack crime scene and there, many victims have been killed there. The adverbial group *down here* indicates the spatial location from where Agent Fran calls.

Supposedly, the reduction of the three constituents will lead to the absence of holistic experiential meaning realization in the subtitles. However, what is so interesting that the subtitles are in the form of a clause, having the word “down” misinterpreted by the subtitler as a verb. The misinterpretation leads the subtitles to become as such in the TT and when it is translated back into English, it becomes as displayed in the BT. Therefore, although the subtitles are in the form of a clause, it does not construe the same experiential meaning realization as in the ST because the subtitles realize it into there are many bodies/corpses which are falling vertically.

Table 11
Example of reduction of participant, process and circumstance

ST	<i>We</i>	<i>got</i>	a lot of bodies	<i>down here</i>
Constituent	Participant	Process	Participant	Circumstance
TT			Mayat	berjatuhan
Constituent			Participant	Process
BT			Bodies	fell down
Constituent			Participant	Process

DISCUSSION

The results show the reduction occurs with all three constituents in seven combinations. The analysis indicates that the subtitles have different experiential meaning realizations compared to their original counterparts because the flow of information, related to participant(s) involved in an event, the event itself and situation as well as conditions accompanying the event, is lost in the subtitles. Consequently, the flow of information concerning the construction and development of the film storyline is not the same between those instantiated by the film verbal texts and their subtitles.

The reduction of participants has an impact on experiential meaning concerning identity as well as a reference in realizing an event. Within communicative situation and discourse, the existence of participants is essential in providing a contextual understanding of an event (Halliday & Matthiessen, 2014; Thompson, 2014). Also, the reduction of participants represents the loss of an entity because in a language, an entity is an embodiment of existing objects, people, objects, ideas, or concepts in this world (Fontaine, 2013).

Bloor and Bloor (2014) stated that participants were used by speakers as entities involved in a particular set of events. Therefore, the reduction of participants in the subtitles has led to experiential meaning realization not including one or more entities which is supposedly included in the inherent event. This is in line with the finding of a study conducted by Matielo et al. (2015) that subtitles which omit participants seem

to neglect the importance of this constituent in realizing processes.

Related to the reduction of processes, this leads to the dismissal of experiential meaning in the subtitles, which dominantly happens on material processes. This is an important finding because the process is the essence of experiential meaning in the clause. Semantically, the experiential meaning in the process provides a model of the speaker's experience and serves to represent the experience by interpreting the configuration of the process, the participants involved in it, and all the accompanying circumstances (Halliday & Matthiessen, 2014).

Concerning the reduction of circumstance, dominantly, it relates to the circumstantial element of location (temporal and spatial). Since *The Kingdom* (2007) is an action film, the dominant process is material and commonly such process is attended in time and place. This is in accordance with de Souza (2008) who states that the material process relates to manner, range, and location.

Lakoff and Johnson (1980) state that the circumstantial information of location informs an event which is indicated as orientation. This is in accordance with the storyline developments of *The Kingdom* (2007) which are related to nationalism, efforts to eradicate terrorism and the chronology of events. The reduction of location concerning spatial information results in the loss of physical activities which, according to Lakoff and Johnson (1980), are the basis of processes.

Meanwhile, the reduction of temporal information results in the loss of process links with historical discourse. *The Kingdom* (2007) includes historical facts in the plot as the basis for the story revolving around terrorism. These allow this film to have some kind of hybridity, mixing reality with fiction. The experiential meaning realization due to the reduction of temporal information results in the storyline depicted in the subtitles no longer positioning history as the foundation for the plot development in the film.

It is accepted that experiential meaning realization of subtitles reduction can be analyzed systemically in the transitivity system (see Matiolo et al., 2015), however, no studies have assessed it functionally, especially in the context of Indonesia. Although Noverino et al.'s study (2019) investigated subtitles reduction systemically and functionally, their findings reported on the experiential realization of the entity and not on the experiential realization of meaning because the scope of their study is on nominal group reduction. Therefore, one of the important findings of the present study is on the functional issue – how reduction of clausal constituents is imposed obligatorily when the meaning contradicts the socio-cultural context of acceptability in Indonesia.

Acceptability refers to whether a translation has been in accordance with the socio-cultural norms and values of the TT (Nababan et al., 2012). Also, Puurtinen (1998) argues that acceptability is crucial in translation as it ensures that the content

of the translated text is in line not only with the cultures of the target language but also with the target readers. In addition, taking into account the aspect of acceptability in a translation means that it deals with the application of certain ideology in a community. Van Dijk (as cited in Puurtinen, 2007) gives the view that ideology is a framework for organizing and monitoring beliefs and attitudes in a community. This definition shows that ideology is a reference or benchmark for people in behaving in a society.

With film subtitles, acceptability is commonly achieved through censorship. Of the four reasons for film censorship, namely politics, political correctness, religion and self-censorship (Scandura, 2004), censorship in this film is motivated by religious considerations. Since *The Kingdom* (2007), purposively or not, portrays terrorism and its related situations to Islam and Muslims, some constituents which contain such portrayals are reduced in the subtitles. The reduction is a censorship policy by the Indonesian Film Censorship Board as regulated by the Indonesian government. Since the population of Indonesia is predominantly Muslims, any sensitive materials in the film which may potentially cause religious disharmony and degrade Islamic sanctities or symbols are subjects to censorship.

The findings and analysis of this study have to be seen in the light of some limitations. Since the data are objective, the analysis is generated from the data. There is no actual information of why the

constituents are reduced by the subtitler. Therefore, methodologically, a suggestion for further study would be to include genetic data, namely data that are obtained firsthand from the subtitler regarding reasons for reducing the clause constituents in the subtitles, which would enhance a more valid and reliable qualitative analysis. Also, the transitivity system as the framework to analyze the data is substantively used within the verbal text and its subtitles while the visual motion pictures are used as context to understand the meaning. Hence, it would be significant for further study to add a multi-modal approach because the analysis covers not only the spoken and the written modes but also the visual modes and non-voiced sounds. This would provide thorough and comprehensive findings that truly represent film as a multi-modes medium.

CONCLUSION

This study is an attempt to highlight how the ideational metafunction of SFL within the framework of transitivity system analysis has contributed insights to the inquiry of experiential meaning realization due to the reduction of English clausal constituents in the Indonesian subtitles of *The Kingdom* (2007). Of 483 collected data instances, the findings show reduction happens systemically on constituents of participant, process, and circumstance in seven combinations which leads to different experiential meaning realization in the Indonesian subtitles. Functionally, the analysis of some data reveals that some constituents which portray terrorism to be

associated with Islam and Muslims are reduced obligatorily as to accommodate the socio-cultural context of acceptability in Indonesia, implemented through censorship.

ACKNOWLEDGEMENT

The writer would like to extend his gratitude and appreciation to his Doctoral Thesis Advisors, Postgraduate Doctoral Program of Sebelas Maret University and Gunadarma University for their support.

REFERENCES

- Bloor, T., & Bloor, M. (2014). *The functional analysis of English: A Hallidayan approach* (3rd ed.). New York, USA: Routledge.
- Buden, B., Nowotny, S., Simon, S., Bery, A., & Cronin, M. (2009). Cultural translation: An introduction to the problem and responses. *Translation Studies*, 2(2), 196-219. <https://doi.org/10.1080/14781700902937730>
- de Linde, Z., & Kay, N. (1999). *The semiotics of subtitling*. Manchester, England: St. Jerome.
- de Souza, A. A. (2008). *'Do the right, be firm, be fair': A systemic functional investigation of national anthems written in English*. (Doctoral Thesis, Universidade Federal de Santa Catarina, Brazil). Retrieved April 4, 2018, from <https://repositorio.ufsc.br/bitstream/handle/123456789/91436/247919.pdf?sequence=1&isAllowed=y>
- Diaz-Cintas, J., & Remael, A. (2007). *Audiovisual translation: Subtitling*. Manchester, England: St Jerome.
- Dries, J. (1995). *Dubbing and subtitling: Guidelines for production and distribution*. Düsseldorf, Germany: EIM.
- Egins, S. (2004). *An introduction to systemic functional linguistics* (2nd ed.). London, England

- /New York, USA: Continuum International Publishing Group.
- Espindola, E. B. (2010). *Illuminated the analysis of the translation is: Systemic functional linguistics strikes Yoda back*. (Doctoral thesis, Universidade Federal de Santa Catarina, Brazil). Retrieved March 21, 2018, from <https://repositorio.ufsc.br/xmlui/bitstream/handle/123456789/103251/284637.pdf?sequence=1&isAllowed=y>
- Feitosa, M. P. (2009) *Legendagem comercial e legendagem pirata: Um estudo comparado* [Commercial subtitling and fan subtitling: A comparative study]. (Doctoral thesis, Universidade Federal de Minas Gerais, Brazil). Retrieved September 3, 2018, from <http://www.bibliotecadigital.ufmg.br/dspace/bitstream/handle/1843/ALDR-832HSQ/743d.pdf?sequence=1>
- Fontaine, L. (2013). *Analysing English grammar. A systemic functional introduction*. New York, USA: Cambridge University Press.
- Gottlieb, H. (1998). Subtitling. In M. Baker (Ed.), *Routledge encyclopedia of translation studies* (pp. 244-248). London, England, and New York, USA: Routledge
- Halliday, M. A. K. (1967). Notes on transitivity and theme in English: Part 1. *Journal of Linguistics*, 3(1), 37-81. Retrieved January 25, 2017, from <http://www.jstor.org/stable/4174950>
- Halliday, M. A. K. (2001). Towards a theory of good translation. In E. Steiner & C. Yallop (Eds.), *Exploring translation and multilingual text production: Beyond content* (pp. 13-18). Berlin, Germany, and New York, USA: Mouton de Gruyter.
- Halliday, M. A. K., & Matthiessen, C. M. I. M. (2006). *Construing experience through meaning: A language based approach to cognition*. London, England, and New York, USA: Continuum.
- Halliday, M. A. K., & Matthiessen, C. M. I. M. (2014). *Halliday's introduction to functional grammar* (4th ed.). New York, USA: Routledge.
- Hatim, B., & Mason, I. (1997). *The Translator as communicator*. London, England, and New York, USA: Routledge Taylor & Francis Group.
- Kovačič, I. (1998). Six subtitles – Six subtitling texts. In L. Bowker, M. Cronin, D. Kenny, & J. Pearson (Eds.), *Unity in diversity: Current trends in translation studies* (pp. 75-82). Manchester, England: St. Jerome.
- Lakoff, G., & Johnson, M. (1980). *Metaphors we live by*. Chicago, USA: University of Chicago Press.
- Manfredi, M. (2008). *Translating text and context. Translation studies and systemic functional linguistics* (Volume I: Translation theory). Bologna, Italy: Dupress. Retrieved August 5, 2018, from http://amsacta.unibo.it/2393/1/Manfredi_2008_Monografia.pdf
- Martin, J. R., Matthiessen, C. M. I. M., & Painter, C. (1997). *Working with functional grammar*. New York, USA: Arnold.
- Matielo, R. (2011). *Subtitling words or omitting worlds? Systemic functional linguistics unveiling meanings translated out of the subtitles of the tv series heroes*. (Doctoral thesis, Universidade Federal de Santa Catarina, Brazil). Retrieved December 12, 2018, from <https://repositorio.ufsc.br/bitstream/handle/123456789/94929/294683.pdf?sequence=1&isAllowed=y>
- Matielo, R., de Vasconcellos, M. L. B., & Baldiserra, E. (2015). Subtitling words or omitting worlds? A metafunctionally oriented analysis. *Revista de Estudos da Linguagem, Belo Horizonte*, 23(2), 363-388. doi: 10.17851/2237.2083.23.2.363-388
- Nababan, M. R., Nuraeni, A., & Sumardiono. (2012). Pengembangan model penilaian kualitas terjemahan [Translation quality assessment model development]. *Kajian Linguistik dan Sastra*, 24(1), 39-57. Retrieved March 17, 2015,

- from <https://publikasiilmiah.ums.ac.id/bitstream/handle/11617/2220/4.%20MANGATUR%20NABABAN.pdf?sequence=1&isAllowed=y>
- Noverino, R., Nababan, M. R., Santosa, R., & Djatmika. (2019). Reduction of English nominal group experiential structure in Indonesian subtitle: Becoming new entity? *Proceedings of 3rd English Language and Literature International Conference (ELLiC)*, Semarang, Indonesia: Faculty of Foreign Language and Culture Universitas Muhammadiyah Semarang. Retrieved June 24, 2019, from <https://jurnal.unimus.ac.id/index.php/ELLiC/article/view/4725/4252>
- Peraturan Pemerintah No. 18, 2014 tentang Lembaga Sensor Film (IDN) [Government Regulation Number 18, 2014 on Film Censorship Board]. Retrieved July 15, 2019, from <http://www.lsf.go.id/publik/content/582db6283616c>.
- Puurtinen, T. (1998). Syntax, readability, and ideology in children's literature. *Meta: Translators' Journal*, 43(4), 524-533. <https://doi.org/10.7202/003879ar>
- Puurtinen, T. (2007). Evaluative noun phrases in journalism and their translation from English to Finnish. In Y. Gambier, M. Shlesinger, & R. Stolze (Eds.), *Doubts and directions in translation studies: Selected contributions from the EST Congress, Lisbon 2004*. Amsterdam: John Benjamin Publishing Company.
- Santosa, R. (2009). SFL and problems of equivalence in translation. In M. R. Nababan, T. Wiratno, & Djatmika (Eds.), *Proceedings of International Conference on SFL and Its Contribution on Translation Studies* (pp. 9-15). Surakarta, Indonesia: Sebelas Maret University, Indonesian Society of Translation, & Association of Systemic Functional Linguistics in Indonesia
- Santosa, R. (2010). *Logika wacana: Analisis hubungan konjungtif dengan pendekatan linguistik sistemik fungsional* [Discourse logic: Analysis of conjunctive relationships with systemic functional linguistic approaches]. Available from <https://digilib.ums.ac.id/dokumen/detail/17816/Logika-wacana-analisis-hubungan-konjungtif-dengan-pendekatan-linguistik-sistemik-fungsional>
- Santosa, R. (2017). *Metode penelitian kualitatif kebahasaan* [Qualitative research method on language]. Surakarta, Indonesia: UNS Press.
- Scandura, G. L. (2004). Sex, lies and tv: Censorship and subtitling. *Meta: journal des traducteurs/ Meta: Translators' Journal*, 49(1), 125-134. <https://doi.org/10.7202/009028ar>
- Taylor, C. (2000). The subtitling of film: Reaching another community. In E. Ventola (Ed.), *Discourse and community: Doing functional linguistics*. Tübingen, Germany: Günter Narr Verlag. Retrieved April 20, 2018, from http://www.sub2learn.ie/downloads/taylorthe_subtitlingof_film_reaching_another_community.pdf
- Thompson, G. (2014). *Introducing functional grammar* (3rd ed.). Abingdon, England: Routledge.
- U. S. Department of State. (2004). *Annual Report on International Religious Freedom: 2004*. Retrieved August 5, 2019, from <https://www.govinfo.gov/content/pkg/CPRT-108JPRT20429/pdf/CPRT-108JPRT20429.pdf>
- Xie, S. (2014). Translation and the politics of the universal. *Asia Pacific Translation and Intercultural Studies*, 1(1), 2-11. <https://doi.org/10.1080/23306343.2014.883806>
- Zhang, Y., & Liu, J. (2009). Subtitles translation strategies as a reflection of technical limitations: A case study of Ang Lee's films. *Asian Social Science*, 5(1), 113-118. Retrieved October 16, 2018, from <http://www.ccsenet.org/journal/index.php/ass/article/download/545/526>

